

# **SOUTH HAMS DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE**



**Minutes** of a meeting of the **South Hams Development Management Committee** held on **Wednesday, 9th October, 2019** at **11.00 am** at the **Council Chamber - Follaton House**

Present: **Councillors:**

**Chairman** Cllr Brazil  
**Vice Chairman** Cllr Foss

Cllr Brown  
Cllr Holway  
Cllr Long  
Cllr Taylor

Cllr Hodgson  
Cllr Abbott  
Cllr Pannell

**In attendance:**

Councillors:

Cllr May  
Cllr Pearce

Cllr O'Callaghan

Officers:

Head of Development Management Practice  
Senior Specialist – Planning  
Planning Specialists  
Deputy Monitoring Officer  
Specialist Place Making (Landscape)  
Specialist Assets (Drainage)  
Specialist – Democratic Services

28. **Minutes**

The minutes of the meeting of the Committee held on 11 September 2019 were confirmed as a correct record and signed by the Chairman.

29. **Declarations of Interest**

Members and officers were invited to declare any interests in the items of business to be considered and the following were made:

Cllrs V Abbott, M Long and G Pannell all declared a personal interest in applications **4015/18/FUL**: READVERTISEMENT (Revised plans received) Proposal for 23 new holiday lodges with associated bases, parking and internal access road – Salcombe Retreat, Lane to Soar Mill Hotel, Malborough, and **2259/19/HHO**: Householder application for extension to living area, creation of ensuite bedroom wing, attached garage and courtyard garden (resubmission of 3978/18/HHO) Part retrospective – Sharpitor Cottage, South Sands, Salcombe, by virtue of all being members of the National Trust, who had submitted an objection to both applications;

Cllr B Taylor declared a personal interest in the following planning applications that were sited within the South Devon AONB by virtue of being a Member of the South Devon AONB Partnership Committee and he remained in the meeting and took part in the debate and vote thereon:

**2407/19/F**: Erection of single dwelling – Tresco, Knighton Road, Wembury;

**4015/18/FUL**: READVERTISEMENT (Revised plans received) Proposal for 23 new holiday lodges with associated bases, parking and internal access road – Salcombe Retreat, Lane to Soar Mill Hotel, Malborough;

**2259/19/HHO**: Householder application for extension to living area, creation of ensuite bedroom wing, attached garage and courtyard garden (resubmission of 3978/18/HHO) Part retrospective – Sharpitor Cottage, South Sands, Salcombe

**2186/19/FUL**: Erection of a new building consisting of 4no. 1 bed 2 person apartments – Vacant land between Davis Road and Townstal Road, Dartmouth

30. **Public Participation**

The Chairman announced that a list of members of the public and town and parish council representatives, who had registered their wish to speak at the meeting, had been circulated.

31. **Planning Applications**

The Committee considered the details of the planning applications prepared by the Planning Case Officers as presented in the agenda papers, and considered also the comments of Town and Parish Councils together with other representations received, which were listed within the presented agenda reports, and **RESOLVED** that:

**a) 2428/18/FUL Meadowbrook, Shiners Bridge, Dartington  
Parish: Dartington**

Upgrade and extension to existing play park and creation of bike track in woodland recreation area

Case Officer Update: Two late letters of objection had been received within the last 24 hours. The letters raised no new issues other than referring to recent media reports highlighting that the UK was in danger of losing mammal species and 15% of species were in danger of extinction

Speakers included: Objector – Ms Trudy Turrell: Supporter – Ms Mandy Burton: Parish Council representative – Cllr Simon Mcinnes: Ward Member – Cllr Hodgson

**Recommendation:** Conditional Approval

**Committee Decision:** Conditional Approval

Conditions:

1. Time limit
2. Accord with plans
3. Submission of tree protection methodology prior to construction of the bike track
4. Submission of a plan indicating where the replacement planting will be carried out, prior to construction of a cycle track
5. Adherence to the Ecology report
6. Written confirmation that the provisions in the ecology report have been properly created by a suitably qualified ecologist
7. Prior to construction provision of a LEMP to be approved by LPA
8. No lighting within the woodland
9. Development to be carried out in accordance with the submitted FRA and the following mitigation and a flood warning and evacuation plan and appropriate signage alerting the public to the flood risks

**b) 2407/19/FUL Tresco, Knighton Road, Wembury  
Parish: Wembury**

Erection of single dwelling

Case Officer Update: The case officer confirmed comments of the speaker that drainage matters had now been agreed

Speakers included: Supporter – Mr Andy Coughlan: local Ward Member - Cllr Brown

**Recommendation:** Refusal

**Committee Decision:** Refusal

**c) 4015/18/FUL Salcombe Retreat, Lane to Soar Mill Hotel,  
Malborough  
Parish: Malborough**

READVERTISEMENT (Revised plans received) Proposal for 23 new holiday lodges with associated bases, parking and internal access road

Case Officer Update: The case officer updated the Committee following queries raised at the site inspection related to parking provision for those lodges without adjacent parking spaces. One late letter of objection had been received that referred to highway grounds and lack of car parking. The long list of conditions had been missed from the back of the report, and there were two additional conditions proposed that related to aligning materials to the existing lodges and confirmed the period of non-occupancy as per the existing lodges from 15 January to 15 March.

Speakers included: Supporter – Mr Malcolm Gigg; Parish Council – Cllr John Yeoman; and Ward Members – Cllrs Long and Pearce

**Recommendation:** Conditional Approval

During discussion, Members were shown a number of photographs taken of the site from viewpoints in the area. The Parish Council representative advised that the application was contrary to the recently adopted Malborough Neighbourhood Plan in that it sought to transfer an area of land previously for tents and caravans, to a permanent site of lodges.

Members did not feel that the application conserved and enhanced the AONB, and did not have confidence in the landscape proposals submitted. Some Members however, felt that the recent declaration of climate change indicated that better holiday provision should be available in this country and supported the proposal.

**Committee Decision:** Refusal

Reasons:

The proposal would have a detrimental impact on the AONB, would be contrary to JLP policies DEV 24, DEV 25 and Policy 27 of the Malborough Neighbourhood Plan

**d) 2259/19/HHO Sharpitor Cottage, South Sands,  
Salcombe  
Parish: Salcombe**

Householder application for extension to living area, creation of en-suite bedroom wing, attached garage and courtyard garden (re-submission of 3978/18/HHO) Part retrospective

Case Officer Update: None

Speakers included: Town Council representative – Cllr Mike Fice:  
Ward Member – Cllrs Long and Pearce

**Recommendation:** Conditional Approval

During discussion, the Town Council representative advised that the proposal was contrary to the recently adopted Salcombe Neighbourhood Plan. The Members noted from the site inspection that the parking facilities were cramped and the proposal had no outlook and the residential amenity was poor. The design was not in keeping and the proposal did not conserve or enhance the AONB

**Committee Decision:** Refusal

Reasons:

1. The proposed development, by reason of its scale and design, fails to offer its occupants a satisfactory standard of amenity, contrary to adopted policy DEV1 (1) Residential amenity.
2. The proposed development, by reason of its scale, design and materials, fails to conserve and enhance the landscape and scenic beauty of this part of the South Devon Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty, contrary to adopted policies SPT2 (10) Sustainable linked neighbourhoods and sustainable rural communities, SPT11 Strategic approach to the historic environment, SPT12 (4, 5) Strategic approach to the natural environment, DEV20 (2 and 4) Place shaping and the quality of the built environment, DEV23 (1, 2, 3, 7) Landscape character, DEV24 Undeveloped Coast and Heritage Coast (3, 5) and DEV25 Nationally protected landscapes (2, 3, 8), policies ENV1 and B1 of the Salcombe Neighbourhood Plan and the guidance of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) contained but not limited to paragraphs 170, 172 and 173. It is therefore recommended that the application be refused.

NB: As this application was part retrospective, the Committee voted to request officers to proceed with enforcement action.

**e) 2253/19/HHO 3 Highfield Drive, Kingsbridge  
Parish: Kingsbridge**

Householder application for proposed first floor side extension

Case Officer Update: None

Speakers included: Ward Member – Cllr O’Callaghan

**Recommendation:** Conditional Approval

**Committee Decision:** Conditional Approval

Conditions

Standard time limit

Adherence to plans

Materials samples

Obscure glazing

**f) 2045/19/HHO 3 Higher Brook Road, Ivybridge  
Parish: Ivybridge**

Householder application for proposed ground floor extension to form new shower room

Case Officer Update: None

Speakers included: Supporter: Mrs Luscombe (statement read):  
and Ward Member – Cllr May

**Recommendation:** Refusal

**Committee Decision:** Refusal

**g) 2186/19/FUL Vacant land between Davis Road and Townstal  
Road, Dartmouth  
Parish: Dartmouth**

Case Officer Update: None

Speakers included: Objector – Mrs Grace Hamilton: Supporter –  
Mr George Hardy

**Recommendation:** Delegate to Head of Development Management Practice, in consultation with the Chairman, to conditionally grant planning permission, subject to a s106 legal obligation.

However, in the event that the s106 legal Agreement remains unsigned six months after this resolution, that the application is

reviewed by the HOP Lead Development Management, in consultation with the Chairman of the Committee, and if no progress is being made, delegated authority is given to the HOP Lead Development Management to refuse the application in the absence of a signed s106 Agreement.

**Committee Decision:** Delegate to Head of Development Management Practice, in consultation with the Chairman, to conditionally grant planning permission, subject to a s106 legal obligation.

However, in the event that the s106 legal Agreement remains unsigned six months after this resolution, that the application is reviewed by the HOP Lead Development Management, in consultation with the Chairman of the Committee, and if no progress is being made, delegated authority is given to the HOP Lead Development Management to refuse the application in the absence of a signed s106 Agreement.

Members requested an amendment to the planning condition on sample materials requesting that material colours should be in keeping with the area.

Conditions:

Time limit

Approved plans

Unexpected land contamination

Vehicle crossing

Construction Management Plan

Surface Water Drainage

Foul Drainage

Landscaping scheme

Samples

Remove PD rights

Electric vehicle charging points

Details to demonstrate that ensure that the ventilation system will not exceed the permitted development level for Air Source Heat Pumps which can be found in MCS020.

## 32. **Planning Appeals Update**

Members noted the list of appeals as outlined in the presented agenda report.

The Head of Development Management provided further details on specific recent appeal decisions, and particularly noted the comments of the Inspector regarding housing mix and how evidence to support such arguments must be robust.

The Meeting concluded at 4.30 pm

**Signed by:**

**Chairman**

---



**.Voting Analysis for Planning Applications – DM Committee 9 October 2019**

<b>Application No:</b>	<b>Site Address</b>	<b>Vote</b>	<b>Councillors who Voted Yes</b>	<b>Councillors who Voted No</b>	<b>Councillors who Voted Abstain</b>	<b>Absent</b>
2428/18/FUL	Meadowbrook, Shinnars Bridge, Dartington	Refusal	Cllrs Hodgson, Long, Pannell and Abbott (4)	Cllrs Brazil, Foss, Brown, Taylor and Holway (5)	(0)	Cllrs Kemp, Pringle and Rowe (3)
2428/18/FUL	Meadowbrook, Shinnars Bridge, Dartington	Conditional Approval	Cllrs Brazil, Holway, Foss, Brown and Taylor (5)	Cllrs Hodgson, Pannell and Long (3)	Cllr Abbott (1)	Cllrs Kemp, Pringle and Rowe (3)
2407/19/FUL	Tresco, Knighton Road, Wembury	Conditional Approval	Cllrs Hodgson, Holway and Brown (3)	Cllrs Brazil, Foss, Taylor, Abbott, Pannell and Long (6)	(0)	Cllrs Kemp, Pringle and Rowe (3)
2407/19/FUL	Tresco, Knighton Road, Wembury	Refusal	Cllrs Brazil, Foss, Taylor, Abbott, Pannell and Long (6)	Cllrs Hodgson, Holway and Brown (3)	(0)	Cllrs Kemp, Pringle and Rowe (3)
4045/18/FUL	Salcombe Retreat, Lane to Soar Mill Hotel, Malborough	Refusal	Cllrs Hodgson, Long, Brown and Taylor (4)	Cllrs Brazil, Abbott and Holway (3)	Cllr Pannell (1)	Cllrs Kemp, Pringle, Rowe and Foss (4)
2259/19/HHO	Sharpitor Cottage, South Sands, Salcombe	Refusal	Cllrs Holway, Long, Pannell, Abbott, Brown, Hodgson and Taylor (7)	Cllr Brazil (1)	(0)	Cllrs Kemp, Pringle, Rowe and Foss (4)
2253/19/HHO	3 Highfield Drive, Kingsbridge	Conditional Approval	Cllrs Hodgson, Abbott, Brazil, Holway, Long, Pannell, Brown and Taylor (8)	(0)	(0)	Cllrs Kemp, Pringle, Rowe and Foss (4)
2045/19/HHO	3 Higher Brook Park, Ivybridge	Refusal	Cllrs Abbott, Brazil, Hodgson, Long and Pannell (5)	Cllrs Brown and Taylor (2)	Cllr Holway (1)	Cllrs Kemp, Pringle, Rowe and Foss (4)
2186/19/FUL	Vacant land between Davis Road and Townstal Road, Dartmouth	Conditional Approval	Cllrs Abbott, Hodgson, Holway, Long, Pannell, Brown and Taylor (7)	(0)	Cllr Brazil (1)	Cllrs Kemp, Pringle, Rowe and Foss (4)

This page is intentionally left blank